



LAW'S RESPONSE TO POVERTY

Social Work JSL 4419H
Law 367S

VOLUME I

Professor Janet E. Mosher

September, 1991

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Law and Social Work, University of Toronto. They may not be reproduced or circulated for any other purpose.

BORA LACKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 24 1991

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

LAW'S RESPONSE TO POVERTY

Social Work JSL 4419H
Law 367S

VOLUME I


Professor Janet E. Mosher

September, 1991

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Law and Social Work, University of Toronto. They may not be reproduced or circulated for any other purpose.



Printed on
Recycled Paper



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/lawsresponsetopo01mosh>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume I

Chapter One -- The Demographics of Poverty(a) The "Discovery of Poverty"

B. Ehrenreich, Fear of Falling, The Inner Life of the Middle Class (New York: Pantheon Books, 1989) 1

(b) Definitions

D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 10

J.Hathaway, "Poverty Law and Equality Rights", (1985) 1
Journal of Law and Social Policy 1 19

R. Sidel, Women and Children Last (New York: Penguin, 1987) 21

N. Fraser, "Talking about Needs: Interpretive Contests as Political Conflicts in Welfare-State Societies", [1989]
Ethics 291 22

(c) Distribution of Poverty

D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 32

(i) Children and Poverty
National Council of Welfare, Poverty Profile 37

S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 38

Globe and Mail 42

(ii) Women and Poverty
M.Gunderson and L.Muszynski, Women and Labour Market Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1990) 43

Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 53

(iii) Working Poor
D.P.Ross and R.Shillington, The Canadian Fact Book On Poverty (Ottawa: Canadian Council of Social Development, 1989) 54

| | |
|---|-----|
| Social Assistance Review Committee, <u>Transitions</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) | 58 |
| (iv) Native People | |
| Social Assistance Review Committee, <u>Transitions</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) | 59 |
| R.Powless, "Native People and Employment: A National Tragedy" (1987) 4 <u>Current, Readings in Race Relations</u> 2 | 61 |
| "Economic Issues Facing Native Women in Ontario" (1987) 4 <u>Current, Readings in Race Relations</u> 6 | 65 |
| (d) <u>Dimensions of Inequality</u> | |
| D.Greschner, "Dimensions of Inequality" | 68 |
| G.York, <u>The Dispossessed</u> (London, Vintage, 1990) | 69 |
| L.Rubin, <u>Worlds of Pain, Life in the Working-Class Family</u> (New York: Basic Books, 1976) | 80 |
| S.Baxter, <u>No Way to Live</u> (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) | 94 |
| B.Nelson, "Women's Poverty and Women's Citizenship", [1984] <u>Signs</u> 209 | 96 |
| Globe and Mail, December 12, 1990 | 97 |
| Globe and Mail, July 25, 1989 | 98 |
| <u>Chapter Two -- Understanding the Roots of Poverty</u> | |
| (a) <u>Introduction</u> | |
| M.Morris and J.Williamson, <u>Poverty and Public Policy</u> , (New York: Greenwood Press, 1986) | 99 |
| Economic Council of Canada, <u>Good Jobs, Bad Jobs</u> (Ottawa: Ministry of Supply and Services, Canada, 1990) | 110 |
| (b) <u>Race</u> | |
| F.Henry and E.Ginzberg, "Racial Discrimination in Employment", in Curtis et al (ed), <u>Social Inequality in Canada</u> (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall, 1988) | 120 |
| Globe and Mail, January 21, 1991 | 127 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Globe and Mail, February 1, 1991 | 128 |
| J.Reitz, "Ethnic Concentrations in Labour Markets and Their Implications for Ethnic Inequality", in Breton et al (ed), <u>Ethnic Identity and Equality</u> Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990) | 129 |
| A.Irving, "From No Poor Law to the Social Assistance Review: A History of Social Assistance in Ontario, 1791-1987, Background paper for the Social Assistance Review Committee, July, 1987 | 140 |
| (c) <u>Gender</u> | |
| S.Moller Okin, "Gender, the Public and the Private", University of Toronto Legal Theory Workshop, October 18, 1989 | 141 |
| (d) Gender, Race, Class | |
| F.Henry and T.Rees, "Feminism, Racism and Class" (1983-4) 1 <u>Currents, Readings in Race Relations</u> | 177 |
| R.Ng, "The Social Construction of 'Immigrant Women' in Canada". in Hamilton et al (ed), <u>The Politics of Diversity</u> (Montreal: Book Center Inc., 1987) | 180 |
| "Immigrant and Visible Minority Women in Ontario: Barriers to Employment" (1987) 4 <u>Currents, Readings in Race Relations</u> 16 | 190 |
| R.Coles and J.H.Coles, <u>Women of Crisis</u> (Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1989) | 194 |
| <u>Chapter Three -- The Welfare State</u> | |
| (a) <u>Historical Underpinnings of Canada's Welfare State</u> | |
| D.Guest, <u>The Emergence of Social Security in Canada</u> (2d ed.) (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1985) | 213 |
| A.Finkel, "Origins of the Welfare State in Canada, in L.Panitch (ed.). <u>The Canadian State</u> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1977) | 222 |
| L.Pal, "Federalism, Social Policy and the Constitution", in Ismael, J.(ed) <u>Canadian Social Welfare Policy</u> (Kingston: McGill-Queen's Press, 1985) | 233 |

(b) Theories of the Welfare State

- G.Goodin, Reasons for Welfare (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988) 234
- F.Piven and C.Cloward, Regulating the Poor: The Function of Public Welfare (New York: Pantheon Books, 1971) 240
- M.Walzer, "Welfare, Membership and Need", in Sandel (ed) Liberalism and its Critics (New York: New York University Press, 1984) 260

(c) The Canadian Welfare State

- National Council of Welfare, "Fighting Poverty: The Effect of Government Policy", in D.Drache and D.Cameron (eds), The Other MacDonald Report (Toronto, James Lorimer & Company, 1985) 269
- R.Melchers, "The Cap on Cap" (1990) 14 Perception 19 278
- Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan, Supreme Court of Canada, August, 1991 283

(d) Failings of Canada's Income Security Programs

- G.Riches, "Feeding Canada's Poor", in J.Ismael (ed), The Canadian Welfare State, Evolution and Transition (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1987) 299
- R.Henderson, "Banking on a Better Future", (1989) 13 Perception 8 310
- Globe and Mail Articles 313
- Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 316
- R.Scott, "Living and Dying on the Street: How the Social Service System Failed Drina Joubert", Just Cause 16 318
- Social Assistance Review Board, Decision E-05-14-03R 321

Chapter 4 -- The Social Assistance System(a) A Description

- Social Assistance Review Committee, Transitions (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) 325

| | |
|--|-----|
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 331 |
| MCSS Fact Sheets | 340 |
| Social Assistance Review Committee, <u>Transitions</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) | 347 |
| Globe and Mail, December 19, 1990 | 358 |
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 359 |
| MCSS Fact Sheet | 360 |
| (b) <u>Access</u> | |
| R.Doyle and L.Visano, "Equality and Multiculturalism: Access to Community Services", (1988) 3 <u>Journal of</u> <u>Law and Social Policy</u> | 371 |
| (c) <u>First Nations</u> | |
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 378 |
| S.Baxter, <u>No Way to Live</u> (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) | 384 |
| MCSS Fact Sheet | 386 |
| (d) <u>Recipients' Experiences</u> | |
| Ben Carniol, <u>Case Critical</u> (2d) (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1990) | 388 |
| S.Baxter, <u>No Way to Live</u> (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) | 395 |
| <u>Chapter 5 -- Employment</u> | |
| (a) <u>The Place of Employment in the Welfare State</u> | |
| D.Moon, "The Moral Basis of the Welfare State", in A.Gutmann (ed) <u>Democracy and the Welfare State</u> (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988) | 399 |
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 413 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision J-08-07-03 | 417 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-06-22-02 | 421 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| <u>Kerr v. Toronto General Manager, Department of Social Services</u> , unreported decision, Ontario Divisional Court, June 13, 1991 | 423 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision G-08-03-04 | 431 |
| Globe and Mail, January 5, 1991 | 433 |
| (b) <u>Societal Obligations -- Workfare, Learnfare?</u> | |
| P.Rochman, "Working for Welfare: A Response to the Social Assistance Review Committee", (1989) 5 <u>Journal of Law and Social Policy</u> 198 | 434 |
| Social Assistance Review Committee, <u>Transitions</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) | 442 |
| Globe and Mail | 454 |
| <u>ERN</u> , "Job Training for People on Social Assistance", Fall 1990 | 455 |
| MCSS Fact Sheet | 457 |
| T.Corbett et al., "Learnfare: The Wisconsin Experience", (1989) 12 <u>Focus</u> 1. | 458 |
| <u>Re Howell and Director of Family Benefits</u> (1986) 56 O.R. (2d) 773 | 464 |
| (c) <u>Removing Barriers to Employment</u> | |
| MCSS Fact Sheet | 467 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-10-24-05 | 471 |
| MCSS Fact Sheet | 479 |
| C.Pateman, "The Patriarchal Welfare State", in A.Gutmann (ed) <u>Democracy and the Welfare State</u> (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988) | 484 |
| <u>Chapter 6 -- "The Family"; Public v. Private Support</u> | |
| (a) <u>Defining "the family"</u> | |
| M.Barrett and M.MacIntosh, <u>The Anti-Social Family</u> (London: Verso Editions, 1982) | 499 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| M.Leighton, "Handmaids' Tales: Family Benefits Assistance and the Single-Mother-Led Family", (1987) 45 Univ. Toronto Fac. L. Rev. 324 | 515 |
| <u>Re Burton and Minister of Community and Social Services</u> (1985) 52 O.R. (2d) 211 (Ont. Div. Ct.) | 520 |
| <u>Re Warwick v. Minister of Community and Social Services</u> (1978) 5R.F.L. (2d) 325 (Ont.C.A.) | 526 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision G-09-02-14 | 531 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-02-16-18 | 536 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-04-18-09 | 543 |
| <u>McInnis v. Crowell</u> (1989) 92 N.S.R. 254 (N.S.S.C.) | 553 |
| D.Herman, "Are We Family?: Lesbian Rights and Women's Liberation" (1990) 28 <u>Osgoode Hall Law Journal</u> 789 | 555 |
| <u>Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 561 |
| (b) <u>Public v. Private Support</u> | |
| F.Steel, "The Role of the State in the Enforcement of Maintenance", in <u>Women, the Law and the Economy</u> | 562 |
| <u>Campbell v. Director, Income Maintenance Branch</u> (1990) 71 D.L.R.(4th) 766 (Ont.Div.Ct.) | 568 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision J-03-04-20 | 570 |
| Social Assistance Review Committee, <u>Transitions</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1988) | 578 |
| J.Fudge, "The Privatization of the Costs of Social Reproduction: Sine Recent Charter Cases", (1989) 3 <u>Canadian Journal of Women and the Law</u> 246 | 582 |
| <u>Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 586 |
| J.Lewis, "Feminism and Welfare", in J.Mitchell et al (ed) <u>What is Feminism?</u> (New York) Pantheon Books, 1986) | 587 |

Chapter 7 -- Welfare Administration and Procedural Fairness

(a) Bureaucracy

- K.Ferguson, The Feminist Case Against Bureaucracy
(Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press, 1984) 595
- Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation,
Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 622
- H.Wasserman, "The Professional Social Worker in a
Bureaucracy", [1971] Social Work 89 623
- S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 628
- G.Frug, "The Ideology of Bureaucracy in American Law",
(1984) 97 Harvard Law Review 1276 631

(b) The Due Process Response

- C.Reich, "Individual Rights and Social Welfare: The
Emerging Legal Issues", (1965) 74 Yale Law Journal 1245 633
- Goldberg v. Kelly (1970) 397 U.S.254 638

(c) The Social Assistance Review Board -- an Internal Critique of Procedural Fairness

- J.Leatch, "Procedural Fairness in the Social Assistance
System", Background paper for the Social Assistance Review
Committee, August, 1987 648
- Re Cardinal and Director of Family Benefits (1981),
32 O.R.(2d) 65 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 683
- Social Assistance Review Board, 1989-90 Annual Report 686
- Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation,
Back On Track (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) 694
- MCSS Fact Sheet 698
- I.Morrison, "Security of the Person and the Person
in Need: Section Seven of the Charter and the Right
to Welfare", Journal of Law and Social Policy 700
- Re Singh and Minister of Employment and Immigration
(1985), 17 D.L.R. (4th) 422 (SCC) 717

(d) The External Critique of Procedural Fairness and "Liberal Legalism"

| | |
|---|-----|
| J.Handler, <u>The Conditions of Discretion</u> (New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1986) | 725 |
| <u>Re Gray and Director, Income Maintenance Branch</u> (1985), 50 O.R. (2d) 657 (Ont.Div. Ct.) | 754 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-11-22-06 | 756 |
| Social Assistance Review Board, Decision H-03-21-05 | 759 |
| W.Simon, "Legality, Bureaucracy, and Class in the Welfare System", (1983) 92 <u>Yale Law Journal</u> 1198 | 761 |
| H.Beatty, "Discretionary Decision-Making, Equity and Social Assistance", Background paper for the Social Assistance Review Committee, May, 1987 | 783 |
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 816 |
| K.Lawrence, "Systemic Discrimination: Regulation 8 -- Family Benefits Act: Policy of Reasonable Efforts to Obtain Financial Resources", (1990) 6 <u>Journal of Law and Social Policy</u> 57 | 820 |
| <u>Chapter 8 -- The Rights Debate and Struggles for Social Transformation</u> | |
| (a) <u>The Case Against Rights</u> | |
| M.Tushnet, "An Essay on Rights", (1984) 62 <u>Texas Law Review</u> 1363 | 827 |
| Advisory Group on New Social Assistance Legislation, <u>Back On Track</u> (Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1991) | 835 |
| M.Ignatieff, <u>The Needs of Strangers</u> (New York: Viking Press, 1985) | 836 |
| <u>Re Phillips and Lynch</u> (1986), 27 D.L.R. (4th) 156 | 841 |
| <u>Schachter and the Queen</u> (1990) 66 D.L.R. (4th) 635 (Fed.C.A.) | 843 |
| <u>Silano v. The Queen in Right of B.C.</u> (1987), 33 C.R.R.331 | 846 |
| R.Hasson, "What's Your Favourite Right?", (1989) 5 <u>Journal of Law and Social Policy</u> 1 | 853 |

(b) The Arguments for Rights

- A.Hunt, "Rights and Social Movements: Counter-Hegemonic Strategies", (1990) 17 Journal of Law and Society 309 854
- New York Times, Nov 27, 1990, "U.S. Supreme Court Leaves Intact a Ban on Subway Begging" 864
- P.Williams, "Alchemical Notes: Reconstructing Ideals from Deconstructed Rights", (1987) 22 Harv. Civ.Rights-Civ. Liberties L.Rev. 401 865
- E.Schneider, "The Dialectic of Rights and Politics", (1986) 61 New York Univ. Law. Rev. 589 877
- W.Simon, "The Invention and Reinvention of Welfare Rights", (1985) 44 Maryland L.Rev. 1 884

Chapter 9 -- Conceptualizing a Role for Law in Struggles for Social Transformation

- A.Sarat, "'...The Law Is All Over': Power, Resistance and the Legal Consciousness of the Welfare Poor", (1990) 2 Yale J. of Law and the Humanities 343 921
- J.Hathaway, "Poverty Law and Equality Rights", (1985) 1 J.of Law and Social Policy 1 937
- A.Alfieri, "The Antinomies of Poverty Law and a Theory of Dialogic Empowerment", (1986-87) XVI Rev. of Law and Social Change 659 938
- L.White, To Learn and Teach: Lessons From Driefontein on Lawyering and Power, [1988] Wisconsin Law Rev 699 945
- P.Friere, Pedagogy of the Oppressed (New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1989) 969
- S.Baxter, No Way to Live (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1988) 985
- Ben Carniol, Case Critical (2d) (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1990) 990

Appendix

- Family Benefits Act R.S.O.1980, c.151 998
- General Welfare Assistance Act R.S.O. 1980, c.188 1002

Regulations to the Family Benefits Act

1006

Reg. 318 R.R.O. 1980

Reg. 424/82

Reg. 360/83

Reg. 638/86

Reg. 589/87

